

## 'Dead, Buried, Cremated' and Exhumed? Consensus in Industrial Relations Policy and Politics in Australia 2007-2015

*Rae Cooper*

*We shouldn't allow it to be driven by ideology, and that's on both sides. We shouldn't procrastinate on the things that are common sense and just need to get done. Most importantly, we need to reframe this discussion ... It will not be built by scare campaigns. It will be built through honest, respectful conversation, through having the facts on the table and letting the community decide.*

(Westacott, 2015)

### Introduction

Delivering the Kingsley Laffer Memorial Lecture at the University of Sydney in August 2015, Jennifer Westacott, head of the Business Council of Australia laid out a case for consensus in regulation of industrial relations which reflected what she called the realities of 'the new workplace'. She argued that without greater levels of cooperation and agreement between the major actors and political parties as to the central objectives of such a system reforms would be impossible and debate would remain rhetorical. This chapter examines industrial relations policy and politics in the period from 2007 to 2015. During this eight-year period IR was both a highly contentious policy area and a key political issue upon which elections have pivoted. In the three federal election campaigns of the period IR policy was either a key issue of difference between the major parties or an important 'shadow' issue which the government or opposition sought to neutralise. Beyond campaigns, the hot contestation of IR policy played out in the media and in and alongside various

This is a preview. Not all pages are shown.

## Conclusions

The period 2007-2015 has been a volatile political time and matters relating to industrial relations and workplace policy have never been far from the action. Government and oppositions are wary, in the post-WorkChoices period, of introducing changes which might be seen as too radical. This has been acutely felt by the conservative parties, which have expended considerable effort 'neutralising' community concerns about industrial relations in election campaigns and holding back policy innovation in government. Employing Befort and Budd's, 'efficiency', 'equity' and 'voice' model gives us a framework to understand the underpinnings and the priorities of the major parties in workplace policy. It is clear that there is no consensus between the parties across the dimensions, the parties differ substantially in the ways that they frame each of the concerns in policy and practice. Given the disparate ideological approaches to these three areas, I see no evidence that consensus will emerge between the political parties in the near future. The consensus is also missing *within* the conservative parties in relation to industrial relations. Significant tensions are set to re-emerge government responds to the two major inquiries discussed in this chapter.

## Acknowledgments

Thanks to Sally Hanna Osborne for research assistance and to the editors and symposium participants for helpful comments on an earlier draft of the chapter.

## References

- ABC (2010) 'AWU Has Switched Allegiance to Gillard', *Lateline*, 23 June 2010 <<http://www.abc.net.au/lateline/content/2010/s2935399.htm>>.
- ABC (2013) 'Coalition Paid Parental Leave Policy to Start Mid-2015, "Fully Funded", Abbott Says', Griffiths, E, *ABC News Online*, 19 August 2013 <<http://www.abc.net.au/news/2013-08-18/coalition-announce-start-date-of-paid-parental-leave-scheme/4894636>>.
- ABC (2015a) 'Trade Union Royal Commission: 10 Things to Know after Dyson Heydon's Ruling', Quinn, P, Sveen, B, and Doran, M, *ABC News Online* <<http://www.abc.net.au/news/2015-08-31/trade-union-royal-commission-10-things-you-should-know/6733922>>.

- ABC (2015b) 'Bill Shorten Gets Party Support for Handling of Royal Commission Amid Claims of Widespread Irregular Reporting', Henderson, A, *ABC News Online*, 9 July 2015 <<http://www.abc.net.au/news/2015-07-08/shorten-gets-party-support-for-handling-of-royal-commission/6605494>>.
- ABC (2015c) 'Prime Minister Tony Abbott Says Labor in "Crisis" over Trade Unions Royal Commission', Henderson, A, *ABC News Online*, 20 June 2015 <<http://www.abc.net.au/news/2015-06-20/pm-says-labor-in-crisis-over-royal-commission/6560828>>.
- ABC (2015d) 'Tony Abbott to Dump Paid Parental Leave Policy amid Leadership Speculation', Glenday, J and McDonald, S, *ABC News Online*, 2 February 2015 <<http://www.abc.net.au/news/2015-02-02/tony-abbott-to-outline-policies-at-press-club-address/6061116>>.
- Abetz, E (2014) 'Productivity Commission's Review of the Workplace Relations Framework', minister's press release, 19 December 2015 <<https://ministers.employment.gov.au/abetz/productivity-commission-review-workplace-relations-framework>>.
- Abetz, E (2015) 'Dismissal of Shorten's Sideshow', Senator Eric Abetz, media release, 31 August 2015 <<https://abetz.com.au/news/dismissal-of-shorten-s-sideshow>>.
- Allard, T (2002) 'Abbott's View on Leave Outdated: Labor', *Sydney Morning Herald*, 23 July <<http://www.smh.com.au/articles/2002/07/22/1027332347143.html>>.
- AMMA (2013) 'Resource Industry Welcomes the Incoming Coalition Government', media release, 11 September 2013 <<http://www.amma.org.au/news-media/media-center/resource-industry-welcomes-the-incoming-coalition-government/>>.
- Aston, H and Swan, J (2013) 'Feminist Backs Abbott on "Calibre" Comment', *Sydney Morning Herald*, 7 May 2013 <<http://www.smh.com.au/federal-politics/political-news/feminist-backs-abbott-on-calibre-comment-20130507-2j5l9.html#ixzz3nBeT5XXT>>.
- Australian Bureau of Statistics (ABS) (2015) Industrial Disputes, Australia, Catalogue No 6321.0.55.001, Canberra <<http://www.abs.gov.au/ausstats/abs@.nsf/mf/6321.0.55.001/>>.
- Australian Bureau of Statistics (ABS) (2013) Employee Earnings, Benefits and Trade Union Membership, Australia, Catalogue No 6310.0 August 2013 <<http://www.abs.gov.au/ausstats/abs@.nsf/mf/6310.0>>.
- Australian Financial Review (2011) 'Fair Work Scrutiny Falls Woefully Short', 21 December 2011 <<http://www.afr.com/news/policy/industrial-relations/fair-work-scrutiny-falls-woefully-short-20111220-jj8m1#ixzz3mumHXpO>>.
- Bailey, J and Peetz, D (2015) 'Australian Unions and Collective Bargaining in 2014' 57 *Journal of Industrial Relations* 401.
- Baird, M, Cooper, R and Ellem, B (2009) 'Low-Paid Women: The Impact of Regulatory Change in Australia' 40 *Industrial Relations Journal* 393.
- Baird, M and Whitehouse, G (2012) 'Paid Parental Leave: First Birthday Policy Review' 38 *Australian Bulletin of Labour* 184.

- Baird, M and Williamson, S (2010) 'Women, Work and Industrial Relations in 2009' 52 *Journal of Industrial Relations* 355.
- Befort, S and Budd, J (2009) *Invisible Hands, Invisible Objectives, Bringing Workplace Law and Public Policy into Focus*, Stanford University Press, Stanford California.
- Bourke, L (2015) 'Govt to Tackle Head-on Claims it Is Unfair and Say Borrowing against Our Kids Is the Most Unfair Act of All', *Sydney Morning Herald*, 4 January 2015 <<http://www.smh.com.au/federal-politics/political-news/govt-to-tackle-headon-claims-it-is-unfair-and-say-borrowing-against-our-kids-is-the-most-unfair-act-of-all-20150102-12gtum.html#ixzz3muwQwJuo>>.
- Bourke, L (2015) 'Fair Work Commission Must Not Ignore Penalty Rate Recommendations, Says Eric Abetz', *Sydney Morning Herald*, 21 December 2015 <<http://www.smh.com.au/federal-politics/political-news/well-cop-cuts-to-penalty-rates-when-parliament-sits-on-a-weekend-says-actu-20151220-gls6jb.html>>.
- Brennan, D (2009) 'The Difficult Birth of Paid Maternity Leave in Australia' in S Kamerman and P Moss (eds) *The Politics of Parental Leave*, Policy Press Scholarship Online.
- Buchanan, J (2015) 'Enterprise Contracts Echo "Take it or Leave it" World of WorkChoices', *The Conversation*, 5 August 2015 <<https://theconversation.com/enterprise-contracts-echo-take-it-or-leave-it-world-of-workchoices-45652>>.
- Budd, J (2004) *Employment with a Human Face: Balancing Efficiency, Equity and Voice*, Cornell University Press, Ithaca.
- Cooper, R (2012) 'Industrial Relations Policy and Politics: Introducing the Work Choices Club' 22 *Labour and Industry* 325.
- Cooper R (2014) 'Low-paid Care Work, Bargaining, and Employee Voice in Australia' in A Bogg and T Novitz (eds) *Voices at Work: Continuity and Change in the Common Law World*, Oxford University Press, Oxford.
- Cooper, R and Ellem, B (2008) 'The Neoliberal State, Trade Unions and Collective Bargaining in Australia' 46 *British Journal of Industrial Relations* 532.
- Cooper, R and Ellem, B (2009) 'Fair Work and the Re-regulation of Collective Bargaining' 22 *Australian Journal of Labour Law* 284.
- Crabb, A (2010) 'Mr 70 Per Cent Has Voters in the Palm of His Hand', *Sydney Morning Herald* <<http://www.smh.com.au/opinion/politics/mr-70-percent-has-voters-in-the-palm-of-his-hand-20090914-fnwo.html>>.
- Department of Education, Employment and Workplace Relations (2012) *Towards More Productive and Equitable Workplaces: An Evaluation of the Fair Work Legislation*, Fair Work Act Review Panel's final report, 2 August 2012 <[https://docs.employment.gov.au/system/files/doc/other/towards\\_more\\_productive\\_and\\_equitable\\_workplaces\\_an\\_evaluation\\_of\\_the\\_fair\\_work\\_legislation.pdf](https://docs.employment.gov.au/system/files/doc/other/towards_more_productive_and_equitable_workplaces_an_evaluation_of_the_fair_work_legislation.pdf)>.

- Ellem, B (2013) 'Peak Union Campaigning: Fighting for Rights at Work in Australia' 51 *British Journal of Industrial Relations* 264.
- Ellem, B, Oxenbridge, S and Gahan, B (2008) '*The Fight of Our Lives: An Evaluation of Unions NSW and the Your Rights at Work Campaign 2004-2007*', report prepared for Unions New South Wales, Sydney, November.
- Forsyth, A and Stewart, A (eds) (2009) *Fair Work: The New Workplace Laws and the Work Choices Legacy*, Federation Press, Sydney.
- Gardner, C (2015) 'Productivity Commission: Workplace Relations Framework Review Brings Big Changes' *Sydney Morning Herald*, 6 August 2015 <<http://www.smh.com.au/business/workplace-relations/productivity-commission-workplace-relations-framework-review-brings-big-changes-20150804-girf26>>.
- Grattan, M (2015) 'Abbott Ditches Signature Policy as His Disapproval Soars', *The Conversation*, 2 February 2015 <<https://theconversation.com/abbott-ditches-signature-policy-as-his-disapproval-soars-37032>>.
- Griffiths, E (2013) 'Abbott Unveils Coalition's Workplace Relations Policy', *ABC News Online*, 9 May 2013 <<http://www.abc.net.au/news/2013-05-09/abbott-unveils-coalitions-workplace-policy/4679404>>.
- Hannan, E (2013) 'Peter Reith to Liberals: Go Harder on IR', *Australian*, 16 May 2013 <<http://www.theaustralian.com.au/national-affairs/industrial-relations/peter-reith-to-liberals-go-harder-on-ir/story-fn59noo3-1226643519227>>.
- Hudson, P (2002) 'Howard May Extend Family Tax Breaks', *Age*, 19 July 2002 <<http://www.theage.com.au/articles/2002/07/18/102689888567.html>>.
- Ireland, J, and Wade, M (2015) 'Almost Half of Mothers to Lose Government Paid Parental Leave Entitlements', *The Daily Life*, 11 May 2015 <<http://www.dailylife.com.au/news-and-views/news-features/almost-half-of-mothers-to-lose-government-paid-parental-leave-entitlements-20150510-ggykjm.html>>.
- Joint media release (2014) 'Royal Commission into Trade Union Governance and Corruption Established', Senator the Hon George Brandis QC, Attorney-General and the Hon Eric Abetz, Minister for Employment, 14 March 2014 <<http://www.attorneygeneral.gov.au/MediaReleases/Pages/2014/First%20Quarter/14March-2014-RoyalCommissionintoTradeUnionGovernanceandCorruptionEstablished.aspx>>.
- Kelly, J (2016) 'Abetz Calls Merger "A Disastrous Workplace Relations Cocktail"', *Australian Financial Review*, 7 January 2016 <<http://www.theaustralian.com.au/national-affairs/industrial-relations/abetz-calls-merger-a-disastrous-workplace-relations-cocktail/news-story/6242148f9ae4624aa3e9b29af6646c45>>.
- Liberal Party of Australia (2013) 'The Coalition's Paid Parental Leave Scheme', Tony Abbott, media release, 18 August 2013 <<https://www.liberal.org.au/latest-news/2013/08/18/tony-abbott-coalitions-paid-parental-leave-scheme>>.
- Liberal Party of Australia (2015) 'Prime Minister – Address to the National Press Club', 2 February 2015 <<http://www.liberal.org.au/latest-news/2015/02/02/prime-minister-address-national-press-club>>.

- Muir, K (2008) *Worth Fighting For: Inside the 'Your Rights at Work' Campaign*, UNSW Press, Sydney.
- Oliver, D (2016) 'Rebuilding Confidence in Our Public Institutions: The Need for a National Corruption Watchdog, ACTU', opinion piece <<http://www.actu.org.au/actu-media/speeches-and-opinion/rebuilding-confidence-in-our-public-institutions>>.
- Owens, J and Colman, E (2015) 'Union Commissioner Dyson Heydon "Should Stand Down" over Libs Fundraiser', *Australian*, 13 August 2015 <<http://www.theaustralian.com.au/national-affairs/union-commissioner-dyson-heydon-should-stand-down-over-libs-fundraiser/story-fn59niix-1227481800218?sv=ec7c9a41ca2f02b9a81255bd182c883e>>.
- Peetz, D (2005) 'Hollow Shells: The Alleged Link Between Individual Contracting and Productivity Growth' 56 *Journal of Australian Political Economy* 33.
- Peetz, D and Bray, R (2015) 'Change Penalty Rates, Reform Work Agreements, Urges Productivity Commission: Experts Respond', *The Conversation*, 4 August 2015 <<https://theconversation.com/change-penalty-rates-reform-work-agreements-urges-productivity-commission-experts-respond-45647>>.
- Productivity Commission (2015) 'Workplace Relations Framework, Draft Report', Canberra <<http://www.pc.gov.au/inquiries/current/workplace-relations/draft/workplace-relations-draft-overview.pdf>>.
- Scott, S (2007) 'Suddenly, All Sides Insist They Put the Family First', *Australian Financial Review*, 21 July 2007.
- Shanahan, D and Kelly, J (2015) "'Listening" Tony Abbott Dumps Paid Parental Leave Scheme Plan', *Australian*, 31 January 2015 <<http://www.theaustralian.com.au/national-affairs/listening-tony-abbott-dumps-paid-parental-leave-scheme-plan/story-fn59niix-1227202886057>>.
- Shorten, B (2011) 'Fair Work Act Review Announced', The Hon Bill Shorten MP, Minister for Employment and Workplace Relations, Financial Services and Superannuation, media release, 20 December 2011 <<http://billshorten.com.au/fair-work-act-review-announced>>.
- Steketee, M (2007) 'Why Working on Family Matters', *Australian*, 10 March 2007 <<http://www.theaustralian.com.au/news/features/why-working-on-family-matters/story-e6frg6z6-1111113128749?nk=21c0b9736e7940136d1065610b501cd6>>.
- Trade Union Royal Commission (2015a) 'Final Report', Royal Commission into Trade Union Governance and Corruption <<http://www.tradeunionroyalcommission.gov.au/reports.aspx>>.
- Trade Union Royal Commission (2015b) 'Reasons for Ruling on Disqualification Applications', Royal Commission into Trade Union Governance and Corruption, evidence, 31 August 2015 <<http://www.tradeunionroyalcommission.gov.au/Hearings/Documents/2015/Evidence31August2015/ReasonsforRulingonDisqualificationApplicationdated31August2015.pdf>>.
- Westacott, J (2015) 'Creating Jobs in the Age of Disruption', Kingsley Laffer Memorial Lecture, University of Sydney, 13 August.